**Appendix 1. Topic guide for interviews**

Figure 2 of our Case for Support traces out an ‘impact chain’ for community music institutions, running from the raised aspirations which those interventions excite (link 2a) to the capacities, or transferable skills, which they are able to stimulate (link 2b), to the factors determining diffusion of impacts to lower income groups (link 3) to impacts on well-being (link 4). This topic guide spells out what questions we will ask at each stage of the causal chain.

***Questionnaire 1* below is for members of orchestras/community music organisations to be sampled by the survey - and for a corresponding ‘control group’, who will be selected to be as similar as possible to the treatment groups members, except that they do not participate in the activities of the selected organisation. The treatment group (members of the orchestra) answer all questions. The control group does not answer questions 1 and 2, and starts at question 3. If possible the questions should be answered in the home of the person selected for interview – not at work or after a concert or rehearsal. If the respondent is under 18, the head of household should also be present at the interview.**

*Preamble:* Hello. My name is…………………………………….and I am working with (name of organisation)

We are conducting a survey of this neighbourhood, in particular to find out what (name of organisation) has achieved in this area and your views about how it could be more effective. The survey will take an hour at most. Your answers will be kept confidential, and will not be revealed to (name of organisation) or any other third party. Participation is voluntary, and if we should come to any question you don’t want to answer, just let me know and I will go to the next question; or you can stop the interview at any time. However, we hope that you will participate in this discussion since your views are important.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Questions for individual musicians participating in the survey, and their families | Notes and remarks |
| **Background (CONTROL GROUP DOES NOT ANSWER THESE QUESTIONS)** |  |
| 1.How did you became involved in the activities of (specify member organisation).  What instrument do you play?  Who suggested that you join; how long have you been a member; what aspects of it are positive and negative for you (probe gently if necessary)  2. What kind of music do you most like?  Does the (orchestra/group) in which you are involved play this music? |  |
| **Aspirations (CONTROL GROUP BEGINS HERE)**  ***Answer ONE of 3a, 3b or 3c, according to age***  3a. *Primary school pupils (4-10) only*  When you grow up, what would you like to be? (*then code for chosen profession*); possibly to be accompanied by questions about musical aspirations.  3b. *Secondary school pupils (11-18) only*  (After you finish school) do you expect to go to university/higher education?  3c. *Adults only*  Over the next two years, do you expect to undertake formal higher education of any sort, outside of this musical training? | As recommended by Flouri and Panourgia(2012) following methodological review by Dalton et al (2011)  As recommended by Khattab(2015) following methodological review by Dalton et al (2011) |
| **Transferable skills: resilience**  ***Answer ONE of 4a or 4b***  4a. *Primary school pupils (4-10) and secondary school pupils (11-16)*  Use questions from Grit Test (Sklar 2011, e.g.  -Setbacks don’t discourage me;  -I am a hard worker;  -I finish whatever I begin.  *4b. Secondary school pupils (16-18) and adults*  Please say whether the following statements apply to you (on a 5-point scale from 5, completely agree to 5, completely disagree):  (score 5) I tend to bounce back quickly after hard times…………….(score 1) It is hard for me to snap back when something bad happens  (score 5) I have a hard time making it through stressful events……………..(score 1) It does not take me long to recover from a stressful event  (score 5) I usually come through difficult times with little trouble…………………………………….(score 1) I tend to take a long time to get over setbacks in my life  If I had a financial emergency and needed £1,000 in a hurry, I would:  (score 5) identify the source of the problem………………………………….(score 1) pray for it to go away  If I had a financial emergency and needed £1,000 in a hurry, I would:  (score 5) take control of the situation………………………………………….(score 1) hope for a solution to appear | From Brief Resilience Scale (Smith et al 2008; commended as robust by Windle et al 2011); some questions inserted from Deakin Coping Scale (Moore 2003) |
| **Transferable skills: social skills**  ***Answer ONE of 5a, 5b or 5c***  *5a. Primary school pupils (4-11)*  Researcher’s assessment of child’s ability to:  -accept disappointment well;  -be considerate or thoughtful of other people’s feelings;  -be willing to share things;  -[play or talk with peers for extended periods of time];  -respond to teasing or name calling by ignoring, changing the subject, or other constructive means.  *5b. Secondary school students*  Researcher’s assessment of the student’s response to the following situations:  -When the student promises to do something, can you count on him or her to do it?  -Does the student butt into games and activities even when he or she hasn’t been invited?  -Can the student follow suggestions of others in group projects, or does he or she insist on imposing their own ideas even when not invited?  -If a task is too difficult for the student, will they get frustrated and quit, or first seek help with the problem?  -Does the student try and do too many things at once, or concentrate on one thing at a time?  *5c. Adults*  Average of scores on the ‘sociability’, ‘emotional self-control’ and ‘internal locus of control’ tests as applied by Esqueda Torres (2004) | Based on Child Trends 2014 (*Measuring Elementary Students’ Social and Emotional Skills, 2014*)  Based on Child Trends 2014 (*Measuring Elementary Students’ Social and Emotional Skills, 2014*)  See the study by Esqueda Torres (2004), one of the few Venezuelan studies conducted independently of *El Sistema* |
| **Transferable skills: conflict resolution/mediation skills**  ***Answer ONE of 6a, 6b or 6c***  *6a Primary school pupils(4-11)*  Researcher’s assessment of relative effectiveness (with individual students) of  - ‘stone-paper-scissors’ game,  -I-messages,  -and peace paths to assess capacity for conflict management (Playworks 2011)**,** according to the researcher’s assessment.  *6b. Secondary school students*  (to be supplied)  *6c. Adults*  Researcher’s assessment of respondent’s ability and willingness to:  -Offer effective incentives to negotiate;  -Put a price on the status quo; and  -Enlist support in favour of the maintenance of negotiations,  -Reframe the game so that it appears as a process within which both protagonists can make gains. | See Playworks(2011)  See Msila(2015), Brandon and Robertson(2007) |
| **Measures of well-being**  *These questions relate to the household in which the respondent lives and should typically be posed to the* ***head of the household or their partner –*** *as well as the student. If the student and the head of the household are the same, fill in one answer only. If they are different, fill in an answer for both the student and the head of the household.*  **7.Health (n.b.not to be used in Sistema Scotland, who have their own questionnaire)**  All the following questions are to be answered.  *The following questions ask for your views about your health, how you feel and how well you are able to do your usual activities.*  *If you are unsure about how to answer any questions please give the best answer you can and make any of your own comments if you like. Do not spend too much time in answering as your immediate response is likely to be the most accurate.*   1. *In general, would you say that your health is (please tick ONE box):*   *Excellent………………………………………………………………………….*  *Very good………………………………………………………………………*  *Good……………………………………………………………………………..*  *Fair/OK…………………………………………………………………………*  *Poor……………………………………………………………………………..*   1. *The following questions are about activities you might do*   *during a typical day. Does your health limit you in these activities? If so, how much? (please tick one box on each line)*   |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | |  | *Yes, limited a lot* | *Yes, limited a little* | *No, not limited at all* | | *(a)Moderate activities, such as moving a table, riding a bicycle or pushing a vacuum-cleaner* |  |  |  | | *(b)Climbing several flights of stairs* |  |  |  |      1. *During the past 4 weeks, have you had any of the following problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of your physical health? (Please answer Yes or No to each question)*  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | |  | *Yes* | *No* | | *Accomplished less than you would like* |  |  | | *Were limited in the kind of work or other activities* |  |  |  1. *During the past 4 weeks, have you had any of the following problems with your work or other regular daily activities as a result of any emotional problems (such as feeling depressed or anxious? (Please answer Yes or No to each question)*  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | |  | *Yes* | *No* | | *Accomplished less than you would like* |  |  | | *Didn’t do work or other activities as carefully as usual* |  |  |  1. *During the past 4 weeks, how much did pain interfere with*   *your normal work (including both work around the house and work outside the house)? Please tick one box:*   |  |  | | --- | --- | | Not at all |  | | A little bit |  | | Moderately |  | | Quite a bit |  | | Extremely |  |  1. *These questions are about how you feel and about how things have been with you during the past month. For each question, please indicate the one answer that comes closest to the way you have been feeling. (Please tick one box on each line)*  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | | How much time *during the last month:* | All of the time | Most of the time | A good bit of the time | Some of the time | A little of the time | None of the time | | (a)Have you felt  calm and peaceful? |  |  |  |  |  |  | | (b) Did you have a lot of energy? |  |  |  |  |  |  | | (c) Have you felt downhearted and low? |  |  |  |  |  |  | | (d) Has your health limited your social activities (like visiting friends, fellow-musicians or close relatives? |  |  |  |  |  |  |   **8. Education (n.b. interaction with 3c above)**  *This question is to be asked of both the (musical) trainee and the head of the household. If they are the same person, fill in the form just once for that person. If the trainee is not the head of the household, fill in a separate form for that person.*  *Head of household responses:*  Highest educational level achieved by head of household (*fill in only one category*):  No education…………………………………………………………………………………………  Completed primary education………………………………………………………………  Completed secondary education (i.e. in UK, one or more A levels……………………………………………………………………………………………………  University degree…………………………………………………………………………………  Higher degree (MA, MSc, or PhD)………………………………………………………..  *Trainee responses:*  Highest educational level achieved by trainee (*fill in only one category*):  No education…………………………………………………………………………………………  Completed primary education………………………………………………………………  Completed secondary education (i.e. in UK, one or more A levels……………………………………………………………………………………………………  University degree…………………………………………………………………………………  Higher degree (MA, MSc, or PhD)………………………………………………………..  **9.Household income/employment category**  What is your household’s estimated total *monthly* income (in an average month during the last year) from:  (a)Work…………………………………………………………………………………………………  (b) Sales of goods and services through business (net of purchases of equipment and other inputs)……………………………………………………………………………………………..  (c) State benefits e.g. state pension, unemployment benefit…………………………………………………………………………………………………..  (d) Private pension……………………………………………………………………………….  (e) Remittances from other family member………………………………………………………………………………………………….  (f) Other (specify)…………………………………………………………………………………………………  (a)+(b)+(c)+(d)+(e)+ (f)= Household’s total monthly income………………………………………………………………………………………………..  **10. Household assets**  (a) Is your house: owned/rented…………………………………………………………………………………….  (b) If owned: If you sold your house today, what do you believe its market value would be?……………………………………………………………………………………………………..  (c)How many cars do you have within the household? What is their total estimated value?  **………………………………………………………………………………………………………………**  (d) What is the total current value of your savings?...................................................................................................... | We use here the shortest NHS(UK) health questionnaire, the  SF-12, commended by Jenkinson et al. (1997) as ‘the instrument of choice’ when two summary scores are adequate. |
| **iv. Influences on well-being – financing and charging policies** |  |

Notes on control group questionnaire – in particular specify what it leaves out

***Questionnaire 2 is for concert audiences – those attending events put on by the selected organisation but not members of it.***

1. ***Audience motivation***

**(a)*What motivated you to go along to the concert?***

At first, simply write down the answer freely given

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..

*But check if any of the following answers also apply (multiple answers possible)* **:**

To get inspiration from my own creative practice………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….To socialise with friends or family (*note any family or friendship connections with orchestra members*)……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..

The kind of music that’s programmed appeals to me………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

To support my local community………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

**(b) What type of music performances do you typically attend?**

…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

1. ***Marketing channels***

***How did you find out about the performance on (specify date and programme of concert, if interview done at a later date)? Multiple answers possible***

Orchestra/organisation brochure…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

Orchestra/organisation website…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Newspaper article (specify which paper)……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..

Posters…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Social media (specify which)…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Word of mouth…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Other (specify)……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

1. ***Respondent’s response to the concert and the audience***

What did you feel about the concert?

………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Initially ask as an open-ended question to capture the respondent’s feelings.

Depending on how full and how fluent the respondent’s reply is, the following issues could be used as prompts:

* Was there any part of the concert (any particular piece) which you particularly liked or disliked? (if they pick up on this, check whether the response attaches to whether it is the piece of the technical quality of the performance which they liked or disliked)
* the perceived technical quality of particular sections of the orchestra;
* the programming (whether they thought the programme was well-chosen and well-structured, e.g. contained a linking thread which made them think
* Finally, did they think the audience was representative of the city as a whole? Did any age-groups, social strata or ethnic groups seem to them to be under-represented? This last issue can be drawn out into a discussion of the links between the city and the surrounding community, under 4 below).

1. ***Links with the local community… and how the sampled orchestra could get closer to***

***it (mention policy options and role of fees, subsidies, etc)***

Picking up on your answer to the last question, can you see any ways in which the audience for concerts such as this could be broadened?

…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

AT FIRST DO NOT PROMPT. AFTER ABOUT A MINUTE, REVIEW THE FOLLOWING POSSIBILITIES WITH THE RESPONDENT AND SEE IF YOU GET A RESPONSE (BUT DO NOT INDICATE APPROVAL OR DISAPPROVAL)

*Publicity –* Was it available where needed? Did it send out the right message? Did it make sufficient use of different channels (website, brochures, posters, internet, social media etc)

*Composition of the programme –* Did it strike the right balance between familiar and new, innovative music?

-Did it strike the right balance between genres? For you, and from the point of view of broadening the audience (*ask the questions separately*) could it ideally have been moved to a different place on the classical/folk and world music/rock music spectrum?

- Could it with advantage have been aimed at specific

groups within the community who were not represented within this concert?

-Would it in your view be helpful for structures such as consultative communities to be set up which would provide a channel of communication between the orchestra/sponsoring organisations and the audience?

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..

[If issues of cost and pricing are raised, refer them to the next question.]

1. ***Price sensitivity***

How much are you willing to spend on a ticket to attend performances by:

-Orchestras/bands/groups touring internationally?

……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

-Orchestras/bands/groups touring nationally?

................................................................................................................................

-Community music groups, [including the resident ensemble. where relevant]

………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………?

..............................................................................................................................

(for each category, code: under £5/£5-£10/£10-£15/£15-£20/£20-£30/Over £30)

***6.Awareness of the sponsoring organisation and its function***:

Please refer back to your answer to question 2 (how did you learn about this concert?)

What previous knowledge did you have of (the lead organisation organising the concert)?

…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

AT FIRST DO NOT PROMPT; BUT IF ASKED FOR MORE DETAIL PROMPT AS FOLLOWS:

Whether respondent is related to a member of (the sampled organisation);

………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

What knowledge the respondent has of the sampled organisation’s underlying purpose

( *typically open-access musical education and special-needs provision etc; the latter varying from case to case*)

If the respondent shows any interest, whether the respondent has any ideas on whether the job could be done better, e.g. whether there are particular groups in need of such support who are not currently getting it.

***7.Respondent’s background****:* Finally please may we ask you for a few personal details? (The ones marked \* can be written down directly without troubling the interviewee.)

Age…………………………………………………………………………

Gender\*……………………………………………………………….

Place of residence………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… (*simply indicate location or* (in UK) *postcode, a street address is not needed* )

Highest educational level achieved (code higher degree/bachelor’s degree/finished secondary education/finished primary education/no qualifications…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………..

Musical experience and qualifications…………………………………………………………………………………………..

Membership of affinity groups and social networks (clubs, professional associations, etc)……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Current employment…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

Household income: Please estimate which of the following income ranges your total annual household income falls within (tick one only):

£0-17500……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

£17500-30000……………………………………………………………………………………………………………………….

£30000-45000………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

More than £45000…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………